Minutes of a meeting of the Council of the Princeton University Community held March 27, 2017 in 101 Friend Center. Present were Prof. Abbe, Mr. Asparrin, Ms. Calhoun, Ms. Cambia, Prof. Carvalho, Ms. Cook, Mr. Durkee, President Eisgruber (chair), Prof. Fore, Ms. Friedman, Dean Gonzalez, Ms. Grah, Ms. Hastings, Ms. Jemison, Prof. Laffan, Provost Lee, Ms. Lett, Mr. Mehr, Ms. Mehr, Mr. Nowak, Prof. Ostriker, Ms. Romero, Ms. Rosen, Prof. Rouse, Prof. Schor, Ms. Shannon, and Mr. Wu. Ms. Halliday was secretary.

The President requested and received approval of minutes of the February 20, 2017, meeting which had been circulated in advance of the meeting. As suggested by the Executive Committee, to allow more time for discussion of the two agenda topics at the day’s meeting, there was no Question and Answer session.

Town-Gown Relationships

The meeting began with a presentation by Vice President and Secretary Robert Durkee about the relationships between Princeton town and the University. As shown in the attached slides (Appendix A), financial support from the University for various town projects has grown over the years. According to the annual voluntary contribution agreement with the town, finalized in 2014, the University will give an unrestricted contribution of $22 million over a seven year period. This is in addition to $9.12 million in property taxes for 2016, $5.68 million of which is for property that qualifies for exemption. As a result of a settlement of a law suit in 2016, the University provides assistance to the town’s lower-income residents with property tax relief as detailed on the fourth slide. Mr. Durkee introduced the Director of Regional Affairs Kristin Appelget and a panel from the University community to describe support other than financial contributions that the University makes to the community. Panel members included the following and each spoke of programs in which they are involved that benefit the town and the University:

Daniel Escheverri ’17, a Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering major pursuing certificates in Robotics and Intelligence Systems and Astrobiology. He is from West Windsor, New Jersey. He is a member of the First Aid Rescue squad.

Edric Huang ’18, an Anthropology major pursuing certificates in Urban Studies and Creative Writing. He spoke about some of the mentoring programs with area youngsters that students participate in and also the assistance given to residents who wish to apply for affordable housing.

Sandra Kearney is a scheduler and planner for testing and inspection of campus safety systems in the Site Protection Department of Facilities and has worked at Princeton University for nearly 12 years. She spoke about Princeton staff volunteers for the Princeton fire department who are on call while at work at the University.
Brett Bonfield is the Director of the Princeton Public Library, a position he has held since January, 2016. He reminded the audience that Princeton University members can join the Princeton Public Library. He described some of the programs sponsored by the library including film series and mentoring programs.

A local resident, Bob Pollack described the vibrant auditing program that allows community members to audit Princeton courses.

In response to a question, Ms. Appelget said that one area that offers good collaboration potential is centered on the activities of the entrepreneurial efforts of the University. E-Hub may present opportunities to connect the University and the town in efforts to resolve issues of concern to the town and the region, for instance, to develop a carbon mitigation project.

The President thanked the panelists for all that they do to knit the University and the town together.

CPUC Resources Committee Interim Report

The President introduced the CPUC Resources Committee’s interim report by underscoring that this was an opportunity to hear from the committee on its review of topics this year and to discuss before the committee’ annual report its current thinking about a proposal regarding investment in private prisons. No final report has been issued; the Resources Committee has stated its desire and intention to continue to discuss proposals with the Princeton Private Prison Divestment group, members of which had been invited to speak to the Council today.

The President stated that the University does not currently have any investment holdings in private prisons. The question remains whether the University should place a “filter” on any future investment possibilities regarding such institutions. He introduced the chair of the Resources Committee, Professor of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering Michael Littman, for the committee’s update.

Professor Littman introduced committee members who were in attendance at the meeting and briefly reviewed some of the past actions taken by the committee with respect to considering or recommending divestment. (The powerpoint with information about the committee is attached as Appendix B.) He underscored the guidelines adopted by the Trustees of the University which determine when a recommendation should be made to the Trustees about possible divestment/disassociation (p. 6 of Appendix B):

- “Considerable, thoughtful, and sustained interest on campus”
- “Direct and serious contradiction with a central University value”
- “Consensus on how the University should respond to the situation” (consider the magnitude, scope, and representativeness of the expressions of campus opinion)
- Divestment implies dissociation
The chair and members of the committee described the reasons they believe that, in its current form, the proposal for private prison divestment does not meet these guidelines including the need for additional empirical evidence. The chair underscored that the issue is still under active consideration by the committee.

Members of the Princeton Private Prison Divestment group spoke about the campus support for their proposal that has been shown by various petitions. They expressed frustration with the process followed by the Resources Committee and asked for a clearer idea of what additional empirical evidence would be helpful. Inviting council members to join a “teach-in” they were sponsoring in the Friend Center lobby, they left the meeting reiterating their call for divestment and dissociation.

The President thanked members of the Resources Committee for taking on a difficult and sometimes emotional question. Lively discussion followed with Resources Committee members explaining their thinking and discussion of possible ramifications whenever the University divests. There was discussion about sources of additional empirical information that might be reviewed and it was noted that if it had reason to do so, the Resources Committee could prepare its own proposal regarding divestment for transmittal to the Trustee Finance committee.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann Halliday
Secretary
Princeton University
Annual Voluntary Contribution
to Princeton

- Agreement finalized in 2014, $22 million over seven years
- Escalates 4% annually
- $3.09 million in 2017
- Reaches $3.48 million in 2020
- Is entirely unrestricted
- Is in addition to $9.12 million in 2016 property tax payments
  - Of this, $5.68 million is for property that qualifies for exemption
Other Contributions Under the Agreement

- $500,000 for a new First Aid and Rescue Squad facility
- $500,000 for firefighting apparatus
  - $250,000 to expand Witherspoon Fire Station (in addition to $300,000 previously committed)
  - $250,000 toward new facility for public works equipment
- $90,000 toward a new Free-B vehicle
- Donation of the Franklin Street parking lot for municipal use
Settlement Agreement

- Donations to a property tax relief fund for lower-income and senior homeowners
  - $2.0 million in 2017
  - $1.6 million annually for five years from 2018-2022
  - Any excess to be donated to 101:Inc. for scholarships

- Donations to Witherspoon Jackson Development Corporation
  - $416,700 annually in 2017, 2018, and 2019
Voluntary Payments to Princeton

![Bar chart showing voluntary payments to Princeton from 1997 to 2016. The payments are categorized as Princeton Voluntary Payment (green), Township Voluntary Payment (red), and Borough Voluntary Payment (blue). The payments have increased significantly over the years.]
PRINCETON PUBLIC LIBRARY,
HINDS PLAZA, ARTS COUNCIL OF PRINCETON
UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER OF PRINCETON, COMMUNITY PARK POOL, PRINCETON BATTLE MONUMENT, PRINCETON HIGH SCHOOL
Merwick Stanworth

- 269 University units
- 56 Affordable units
VOLUNTEER FIREFIGHTER PROGRAMS
Associate Membership Program
Princeton Student Firefighter Association
PRINCETON FIRST AID & RESCUE SQUAD
TRANSPORTATION: TIGER TRANSIT AND BIKE SHARE
Resources Committee composition

- **Representing students**: Colette Johnson, GS; Grace Obiofuma, ‘18; Shannon Osaka, ‘17
- **Representing faculty**: Bo Honore (Econ), Blaire Schoene (Geo)
- **Representing staff**: Janet Finnie (Health Services)
- **VP for Finance and Treasurer**: Carolyn Ainslie
- **Chair**: Michael Littman (MAE)

_Sits with the Committee:_
- **Princo**: Susan Ciniglio
- **Staff**: Mark Dingfield
Preliminaries

• Commitment to freedom of expression, respectful, thoughtful and reasoned debate.

• The University’s core mission is to transmit and expand knowledge through scholarship, research and teaching.

• The purpose of the endowment is to support that core mission through the investment of the University’s financial resources to produce high, reliable, long term returns.
Princeton’s History of Divestment

• South Africa (Apartheid) - 1987
• Darfur (Genocide) - 2006
Recent proposals to CPUC

• Israeli/Palestine
• Princeton Sustainable Investment Initiative
• Gun manufacturers
Guidelines for the Resources Committee

Trustee Statement on Divestiture (1987):
“the purpose of selective divestiture is to separate the University from companies whose conduct contravenes the values of the University; **the purpose is not to make political statements, to censure governments, or to pressure either companies or governments to adopt particular policies**”

Guidelines Adopted by Trustees (1997):

- “Considerable, thoughtful, and sustained interest on campus”
- “Direct and serious contradiction with a central University value”
- “Consensus on how the University should respond to the situation” (consider the magnitude, scope, and representativeness of the expressions of campus opinion)
- Divestment implies dissociation
Private Prison Divestment proposal

- Proposal to divest from 11 companies related to the private prison industry, including prison operators, treatment and service corporations, and probation services.
- Meetings with the proposers in March ‘16, November ‘16, December ‘16, and March ‘17.
Committee discussion about proposal (functioning as a peer review panel)

- On March 10, 2017 our Committee responded that “the proposal, in its current form, did not meet the high bar to recommend action.” All eight members of the Committee came to the same conclusion independently.

- One common observation was that further empirical evidence is needed. Each Committee member had other observations that will be included in a final report to the community in early May.

- The issue remains under active consideration, but would need to continue in the next academic year.

- The Committee welcomes further input and questions from the community, including today.